

## The Commitments made by India under the GATS negotiations: A study of the Impact of these Commitments

Dr..Nehaluddin Ahmad

B.Sc., MA, LL.B., LL.M.(Lucknow India)LL.M.(Strathclyde,UK.)LL.D. (Meerut India)  
Senior Lecturer, Faculty of Business and Law, Multimedia University,  
Jalan Ayer Keroh Lama,75450 Melaka, Malaysia  
E-mail: [ahmadnehal@yahoo.com](mailto:ahmadnehal@yahoo.com)

### Abstract

*Developing countries need to ensure that multilateral rules and commitments on trade in services contribute to economically rational policy-making at the national and international levels. This paper shows that India's modest participation during Uruguay /Doha Round negotiations, and assumption of defensive positions, has not been conducive to the achievement of this goal in the Telecommunication sector. In this context, this paper argues that developing countries such as India have created niche for themselves in particular services exports and, therefore, should actively participate in the negotiations to remove barriers in sectors/modes of their trade interest. The commitments of developing countries should take into account the inter-sectoral and intermodal linkages.*

*Lastly, the paper stresses on the need for complementary domestic reforms which would enable developing countries to gain from multilateral liberalization. The paper presents some of the results in progress, and seeks to identify the issues on which we need to improve our understanding.*

### 1-Introduction

World trade has been in existence since the beginning of civilization. It has now become the most important parameter in international relations. Attempts have been made in recent decades to direct and discipline the world trade process. GATT came into effect in 1948 in the wake of Second World War<sup>1</sup>. On December 15, 1993, delegations from 115 countries approved by consensus a World Trade Treaty. Aiming at opening international markets, this package is known as "GATT Agreements – Final Text of the Uruguay Round". It also gave rise to the first

<sup>1</sup> Patrick Low with Aaditya Mattoo, ( Feb.1998) "Reform in Basic Telecommunications and the WTO Negotiations: The Asian Experience", WTO Working Papers series: 98.01 [http://www.wto.org/english/res\\_e/reser\\_e/ae9801\\_e.htm](http://www.wto.org/english/res_e/reser_e/ae9801_e.htm)

multilateral agreement to apply the disciplines of the trading system to services<sup>2</sup>.

The creation of the General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS) was one of the landmark achievements of the Uruguay Round, whose results entered into force in January 1995. The GATS was inspired by essentially the same objectives as its counterpart in merchandise trade, the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade (GATT): creating a credible and reliable system of international trade rules; ensuring fair and equitable treatment of all participants (principle of non-discrimination); stimulating economic activity through guaranteed policy bindings; and promoting trade and development through progressive liberalization.<sup>3</sup>

The General Agreement of Trade in Services (GATS), the WTO agreement covering trade in services, includes under "Communications Services" some sub-sectors that relate to conducting electronic commerce. These sub-sectors include packet-switched data transmission service, electronic mail, information and data-base retrieval, electronic data interchange, code and protocol conversion, and online information and data processing<sup>4</sup> (including transaction processing).

The obligations in these sub-sectors under the GATS vary from country to country. The reasons are that each country's schedule of commitments lists only those sectors subject to a binding commitment, and many countries omitted one or several of the above sub-sectors<sup>5</sup>.

Telecommunications is a key infrastructure for economic development and is required for all forms

<sup>2</sup> Chanda, R., Globalization of Services: India's Opportunities and Constraints, Oxford University Press, New Delhi, 2002. pg19-21

<sup>3</sup> Supra 1

<sup>4</sup> Randeep Rathindran, Carsten Fink, and Aaditya Mattoo (2002) "An Assessment of Telecommunications Reform in Developing Countries." World Bank Working Paper No. 2909 [http://econ.worldbank.org/files/20745\\_wps2909.pdf](http://econ.worldbank.org/files/20745_wps2909.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> Ibid

of trade. Its importance has considerably increased with the recent growth of electronic commerce<sup>6</sup>. New investment in telecommunications stimulates economic development, which in turn facilitates and encourages growth in a wide range of services, many of them very new. The marriage of computer technology and telecommunications has given the necessary means to develop trade in services<sup>7</sup>. The cost of transmitting information between these systems has fallen dramatically. 10 years ago, a 15-minute phone call from New York to New Delhi would have cost US\$ 40 at today's prices. It now costs less than 10 cents to e-mail a 50 pages document over the same distance. A competitive telecommunications market reduces communications costs for businesses and for individuals. The declining prices can be quantified and compared between countries<sup>8</sup>.

Developing countries need to ensure that multilateral rules and commitments on trade in services contribute to economically rational policy-making at the national and international levels<sup>9</sup>. This paper shows that India's modest participation during Uruguay Round negotiations, and assumption of defensive positions, has not been conducive to the achievement of this goal in the Telecommunication sector.

The paper presents some of the results in progress, and seeks to identify the issues on which we need to improve our understanding.

## 2- The General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS)

On 15 February 1997, the WTO successfully concluded nearly three years of extended negotiations on market access for basic telecommunications services. The offers of 69 governments (contained in 55 schedules, counting as one that of the member states of the European Union) were annexed to the Fourth Protocol of the GATS.<sup>10</sup> All industrialized Members and over 40 developing countries large and small from virtually every region of the world took part. The markets of the participants accounted for more than 91 percent

<sup>6</sup> Info, Nugget India and WTO

<http://pib.nic.in/infonug/info0999/i0109991.html#1>

<sup>7</sup> Goswami, Omkar, and David Dollar. 2002.

"Competitiveness of Indian Manufacturing: Results from a Firm Level Survey." Confederation of Indian Industries, New Delhi.

<sup>8</sup> Rupa Chanda, Globalization of Services: *supra* 2

<sup>9</sup> World Economic Forum. 2002/03 and previous years. Global Competitiveness Report. Oxford University Press: USA.

<sup>10</sup> TIA WTO agreement on basic Telecommunication Services

[http://www.tiaonline.org/international/global/wto/wto\\_agreement.cfm](http://www.tiaonline.org/international/global/wto/wto_agreement.cfm)

of global telecommunications revenues in 1995<sup>11</sup>.

The principle document shaping the telecommunications agreement is the General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS), which is an annex to the Agreement Establishing the World Trade Organization signed in Marrakech, Morocco, on April 15, 1994.<sup>12</sup> The GATS comprises three elements:

(1) a framework of general obligations and disciplines for government regulation of trade and investment in services;(2)a series of annexes and ministerial decisions that supplement rules found in the framework and provide a timetable for follow-up activities and additional negotiations; and (3)individual country schedules that commit national governments to accord foreign service providers market access and national treatment, subject to defined exceptions<sup>13</sup>.

The telecommunications agreement incorporates the obligations set-forth in the framework and, in some instances, highlights certain obligations, making them directly applicable to basic telecommunication services<sup>14</sup>. For instance, the telecommunication agreement incorporates rules on:

- **Most Favored Nation** (MFN) treatment—Article II obligates WTO members to accord other members treatment no less favorable than that accorded to any other country<sup>15</sup>;
- **Regulatory transparency**—Article III requires prompt publication of measures relevant to trade and investment in

<sup>11</sup> Eric Senunas, The 1997 GATS Agreement on Basic Telecommunications:

A Triumph For Multilateralism, or the Market? November 14, 1997

[http://www.bc.edu/bc\\_org/avp/law/st\\_org/iptf/articles/content/1997111401.html](http://www.bc.edu/bc_org/avp/law/st_org/iptf/articles/content/1997111401.html)

<sup>12</sup>Magda Shahin, From Marrakesh to Singapore:

The WTO and Developing Countries

<http://www.twinside.org.sg/title/magda-cn.htm>

<sup>13</sup> EC approach to Service March

2001 <http://europa.eu.int/comm/trade/services/sease/rv.htm>

<sup>14</sup> 17 February 1997 Data on Telecommunications Markets covered by the WTO Negotiations on Basic Telecommunications

[http://www.wto.org/english/news\\_e/pres97\\_e/data3.htm](http://www.wto.org/english/news_e/pres97_e/data3.htm)

<sup>15</sup> GATS, Annex on Article II Exemptions, paragraph 2

[http://www.wto.org/english/res\\_e/booksp\\_e/analytic\\_index\\_e/gats\\_01\\_e.htm#article2](http://www.wto.org/english/res_e/booksp_e/analytic_index_e/gats_01_e.htm#article2)

services and notification of changes to these measures;<sup>16</sup>

- **Domestic regulation**—Article VI requires that all measures affecting trade in services be administered in a reasonable, objective, and impartial manner;<sup>17</sup>
- **Monopolies and exclusive service providers**—Article VIII requires signatories to ensure that monopolies and other firms with market power do not act in a manner inconsistent with scheduled commitments<sup>18</sup>.

Ministerial Conference, the top policy making body of WTO, has met at Singapore (1996), Geneva(1998), Seattle(1999), and Doha(2001) Mexico(2003). They set the deadline of January 1, 2005 for the realization of this ambitious program.

### 3. A View of Telecommunications Situation in South East Asian Region

Asia is most notable for the lack of participation of most of the nations in the region; and, with the exception of Australia and New Zealand (two of the world's fastest liberalizing nations), the paucity of their offers<sup>19</sup>. The Indian sub-continent contains two of the least liberalizing offers. India maintains a number of restrictions on the provision of basic telecommunications services, limits foreign ownership and offers commitments to review the further opening of domestic long-distance and international in 2004.<sup>20</sup> India also maintains an indefinite MFN exemption permitting it to apply differential accounting rates from bilateral agreements signed by its international service provider<sup>21</sup>.

<sup>16</sup> see

[http://www.wto.org/english/res\\_e/booksp\\_e/analytic\\_index\\_e/gats\\_01\\_e.htm#article3](http://www.wto.org/english/res_e/booksp_e/analytic_index_e/gats_01_e.htm#article3)

<sup>17</sup> see

[http://www.wto.org/english/res\\_e/booksp\\_e/analytic\\_index\\_e/gats\\_02\\_e.htm#article6](http://www.wto.org/english/res_e/booksp_e/analytic_index_e/gats_02_e.htm#article6)

<sup>18</sup>

see [http://www.wto.org/english/res\\_e/booksp\\_e/analytic\\_index\\_e/gats\\_02\\_e.htm#article8](http://www.wto.org/english/res_e/booksp_e/analytic_index_e/gats_02_e.htm#article8)

<sup>19</sup> Aaditya Mattoo, WTO Conference on Developing Countries in the New Round of GATS Negotiations: From a Defensive to a Pro-Active Role, Geneva 20-21 September 1999  
[http://www.tradeobservatory.org/library/uploadedfiles/Developing\\_Countries\\_in\\_the\\_New\\_Round\\_of\\_GATS\\_.htm](http://www.tradeobservatory.org/library/uploadedfiles/Developing_Countries_in_the_New_Round_of_GATS_.htm)

<sup>20</sup> WTO Document 97-1391, India: Schedule of Specific Commitments, derestricted by the WTO April 11, 1997.

[http://www.bc.edu/bc\\_org/avp/law/st\\_org/iptf/articles/content/1997111401.html](http://www.bc.edu/bc_org/avp/law/st_org/iptf/articles/content/1997111401.html)

<sup>21</sup> WTO Document 97-1388, India: List of Article II (MFN) Exemptions, derestricted by the WTO

Pakistan's offer is only slightly better. It does not commit to permit foreign commercial presence, protects its telecommunications monopoly from competition, while committing only to open markets in data transmission, e-mail, internet and intranet, video-conference services (including telemedicine and tele-education), and private-leased circuit services (only as of 2004)<sup>22</sup>. Only Bangladesh, with the lowest tele-density in the world at two lines per 1000 inhabitants,<sup>23</sup> can really be said to have opened up its market somewhat, by granting licenses to two new operators in wire-telecommunication services, four licenses to new cellular service operators, and permitting full competition in voice and data transmission over closed-user groups and in internet access.<sup>24</sup>

Indonesia protected its various exclusive-rights suppliers in public voice telephone services by committing only to review to determine to admit new suppliers, after the expiration of those exclusive rights, which run as late as 2006.<sup>25</sup> While it does offer competition in domestic mobile cellular, paging, and public payphone service, it conditions service in other areas such as internet access upon use of state-owned satellite facilities for international traffic<sup>26</sup>. The common Asian theme of foreign ownership restrictions is repeated by the remaining East Asian nations that participated in the negotiations. Malaysia merely offers foreigners the ability to acquire equity in its existing telecommunications service providers, and then limits that equity to 30% of the total

April 11, 1997.

[http://216.239.59.104/search?q=cache:q7c7IQiat1AJ:www.wto.org/english/tratop\\_e/serv\\_e/telecom\\_e/el42s1.wp5+WTO+Document+97-1388,+India:+List+of+Article+II+\(MFN\)+Exemptions,+derestricted+by+the+WTO+April+11,+1997.&hl=en&ie=UTF-8](http://216.239.59.104/search?q=cache:q7c7IQiat1AJ:www.wto.org/english/tratop_e/serv_e/telecom_e/el42s1.wp5+WTO+Document+97-1388,+India:+List+of+Article+II+(MFN)+Exemptions,+derestricted+by+the+WTO+April+11,+1997.&hl=en&ie=UTF-8)

<sup>22</sup> Mushtaq Ahmad (2000). "Pakistan and the GATS: An Assessment of Policies and Future Prospects ."

<http://www1.worldbank.org/wbiptf/trade/services/Ahmad.pdf>

<sup>23</sup> Frieden, Rob, International Telecommunications Handbook, (1996), p. 28.

<sup>24</sup> See WTO Background Document

<sup>25</sup> The WTO Negotiations on Basic Telecommunications, World Trade Organization, 1997

[http://www.wto.org/english/news\\_e/pres97\\_e/bt-summ3.htm](http://www.wto.org/english/news_e/pres97_e/bt-summ3.htm)

<sup>26</sup> Stern, Robert M., "Developing Country Interests in the Forthcoming WTO Negotiations," February 16, 2000. The Journal of East Asian Affairs  
<http://www.fordschool.umich.edu/rsie/workingpapers/papers451-475/r456.pdf>

enterprise<sup>27</sup>. Its neighbor Thailand does not even go this far, offering only to revise its commitments in 2006, subject to the passage of a new telecommunications law and the commitment's consistency with that law.<sup>28</sup>

At the beginning of 2003, Asia had a total of over 870 million (fixed and mobile) telephone subscribers; The giant telecom market in China has continued to grow in spectacular style and is expected to reach \$US27 billion by 2006, or 20% of the total Asian market<sup>29</sup>. Structural reform in the various South & East Asian national telecommunications sectors has started to slow as the governments encounter the more difficult issues on their agendas; commitments made to the World<sup>30</sup>. Trade Organization (WTO) for reforms, is however continues. South East Asian nations have to contend with the impact of a lingering global economic slowdown; through 2002 into 2003 the region's telecom sector has continued to grow, but in a somewhat muted fashion<sup>31</sup>.

### 3.1. A View Of Telecommunications Situation in India

The Indian Telecommunication network with 69 million telephone connections is the fifth largest in the world and the second largest among the emerging economies of Asia<sup>32</sup>. Today, it is the

fastest growing market in the world. With teledensity approaching 6.9 per hundred, the target to achieve 15 per hundred by 2010 looks well within reach<sup>33</sup>. India's total mobile subscriber base (both cellular and wireless in local loop-mobile) has reached 27 million. About 85% of the villages have village public telephones (VPTs)- 5,16,887 VPTs exist in India. The remaining 15% that includes 88,970 villages are yet to be covered<sup>34</sup>. Accordingly, India's 10th Five- year plan 2002-07 projects £25 billion worth of investments in 50 million fixed lines, 30 million cellular lines and 20 million Internet connections<sup>35</sup>.

### TELEPHONE NETWORKS STATUS AS OF DECEMBER 2003<sup>36</sup>

Teledensity	6.9%
Basic phone lines	43 million
Telephone exchanges	38,000
Cellular subscribers	20.72 million
Basic telecom subscribers incl.WLL	6.9 million
PCO (Public call Office)	16,55980
Internet Subscribers & users	3.98 million, 18 million
Paging subscribers	0.6 million
Optical fibre route length	579,500 km
Television sets	100 million
PCs	9 million
Cable TV Connections	45 million

The communication industry in India is estimated to be Rs700 billion (£10 billion) by 2006<sup>37</sup>. Due to intense competition, last year saw a considerable rationalisation of tariffs. This is reflected in the growth of industry. Though the subscribers increased by 100% where as revenue is growing at an annual rate of 23% and the target is to achieve a teledensity of 11.5% by 2007<sup>38</sup>.

<sup>27</sup> Krishnan Venugopal, Telecommunication Sector Negotiations at the WTO: Case studies of India, Sri Lanka and Malaysia October 2003

[http://66.102.9.104/search?q=cache:ZTxyAf7YM0J:www.unescap.org/tid/mtg/ituwtoesc\\_s51b.pdf+Lee,+Cassey,+Telecommunications+Reforms+in+Malaysia,+2001+available+at+http://www.cassey.com/fea2001-6.pdf&hl=en&ie=UTF-8](http://66.102.9.104/search?q=cache:ZTxyAf7YM0J:www.unescap.org/tid/mtg/ituwtoesc_s51b.pdf+Lee,+Cassey,+Telecommunications+Reforms+in+Malaysia,+2001+available+at+http://www.cassey.com/fea2001-6.pdf&hl=en&ie=UTF-8)

<sup>28</sup> Footer, Mary E., The International Regulation of Trade in Services Following Completion of the Uruguay Round, 29 Int'l Law.

<http://www.abanet.org/intlaw/publications/ti1292.htm>

<sup>29</sup> Information Highways and Telecommunications in Asia - Volume 1: Asia Telecommunications Market Overview June 2003 Published by Budde Comm

<http://www.mindbranch.com/catalog/product.jsp?code=R170-0165>

<sup>30</sup> Information Highways and Telecommunications in Asia 2003 - Volume 9:

<http://www.mindbranch.com/catalog/product.jsp?code=R170-0171>

<sup>31</sup> *supra* note,1

[http://www.wto.org/english/res\\_e/reser\\_e/ae9801\\_e.htm](http://www.wto.org/english/res_e/reser_e/ae9801_e.htm)

<sup>32</sup> India Telecom News New Delhi October 10, 2003

<http://www.indiatelecomnews.com/newdetails.asp?newsid=307>

<sup>33</sup> UK Trade & Investment, Communication market in India

<http://www.uktradeinvest.gov.uk/telecom/india/profile/overview.shtml>

<sup>34</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>35</sup> Tenth Five-Year Plan 2001-02 to 2006-07. 2003 New Delhi

<sup>36</sup> *Supra* note 33

<http://www.uktradeinvest.gov.uk/telecom/india/profile/overview.shtml>

<sup>37</sup> Deepak Pareek, Telecom Sector in India: Vision 2020 .available at

<http://www.consultingbase.com/classified/clitem.cf?m?adid=321>

<sup>38</sup> *Ibid*

The Indian government has merged the IT and Telecom Ministries to speed up reforms and has passed the Communication Convergence Bill in the Parliament to enable the common regulation of the Internet, broadcasting and telecoms. An independent regulatory body and dispute settlement body is fully functional<sup>39</sup>.

#### 4-India's Commitments under the GATS on Basic Telecommunications.

India was among the first few countries that signed the GATS in 1994. Like many other developing countries, it was suspicious of the service sector negotiations and saw it as a ruse by the developed countries to refrain from making commitments on areas of interest to the developing countries such as textiles and agriculture.<sup>40</sup> In fact, even at the end of the Uruguay Round, when Ministers decided to extend negotiations on trade in basic telecommunications, India was not one of the countries that agreed to be part of the NGBT<sup>41</sup>.

India joined the negotiations, however, because it wanted liberalization by the developed countries in Mode 4 involving presence of natural persons across service sectors for its professionals<sup>42</sup>. India's interest was also heightened by the importance of the telecommunications sector to its then nascent software services sector and its decision to join the Information Technology Agreement at the Singapore Ministerial Conference in 1996. As India was also autonomously proceeding with liberalization of its own telecommunications sectors<sup>43</sup>, India obviously had everything to gain by joining the negotiations and getting some credit for commitments, the benefit of which would anyway extend to other Members under its GATS MFN obligations. Accordingly, India did become a signatory to the Fourth Protocol and made its

commitments effective in February 1998 like most of the other original signatories of the Agreement on Basic Telecommunications<sup>44</sup>.

Most independent assessments of India's commitments in telecommunications services agree that India's approach was primarily defensive and that it did not even commit to the status quo that obtained in reality in India<sup>45</sup>. Voice telephone services India has not taken any commitments in Modes 1 and 2, i.e., cross border supply and consumption abroad categories, which remain "unbound"<sup>46</sup>. In Mode 3, India has taken some commitments in various sub-sectors.

#### 4.1-Achievements in Telecom Sector by India after GATS/Opportunities and Market Segments

##### *Fixed Service Provider (FSPs)*

The Government has allowed unlimited competition in the basic sector. Considering the inherent advantage of scale that the incumbent state operators have, the private companies are setting their networks very selectively and targeting corporate clients with value added services.

The Government has also allowed the FSPs to provide limited mobility by using WLL technology, enabling service providers to roll out services at a faster pace. This has led to an increase in overall circles from eight to thirty one circles<sup>47</sup>. TRAI has introduced regulations on interconnect usage charges, thereby laying the foundation of level playing field. Basic services are forecasted to grow by around 8-10% in 2004<sup>48</sup>.

The government has introduced unified license for fixed and mobile service providers. This will allow all phone companies to become mobile operators by offering cellular and landline/WLL-M services under a single authorisation, ending service-specific licensing<sup>49</sup>.

<sup>39</sup> Telecom Regulatory authority of India

Consultation Paper July 16, 2003

<http://www.trai.gov.in/final%20consultation16th%20july.html>

<sup>40</sup> P.Low and Mattoo (1997) India and Indonesia, for example, bound at less than the *status quo* with respect to foreign equity participation. Other Asian tigers such as Malaysia and Thailand have also made commitments below their *status quo*., p.22

<sup>41</sup> India: Schedule of Specific Commitments, derestricted by the WTO April 11, 1997 WTO Document

<sup>42</sup> Rajesh Chadha (2000). "GATS and Developing Countries: A Case Study of India ." World Bank Capacity Building Project

[http://www1.worldbank.org/wbiep/trade/WTO2000/workshops/Chadha\\_11.pdf](http://www1.worldbank.org/wbiep/trade/WTO2000/workshops/Chadha_11.pdf)

<sup>43</sup> For a historical account of countries' schedules and negotiations see Low and Mattoo (1998).

<sup>44</sup> Mattoo, Aaditya, MFN and the GATS; in Cottier and Mavroidis (2000), University of Michigan Press pp.51-100.

[http://www1.worldbank.org/wbiep/trade/papers\\_2000/BPmfn.pdf](http://www1.worldbank.org/wbiep/trade/papers_2000/BPmfn.pdf)

<sup>45</sup> MATTOO A. :Shaping future GATS rules for trade in services. World Bank, 2001,working paper,[http://econ.worldbank.org/files/1716\\_wps2596.pdf](http://econ.worldbank.org/files/1716_wps2596.pdf)

<sup>46</sup> GATS/SC/42/Suppl.3 dated April 11, 1997.

<sup>47</sup> *supra* note 4

[http://econ.worldbank.org/files/20745\\_wps2909.pdf](http://econ.worldbank.org/files/20745_wps2909.pdf)

<sup>48</sup> *supra* 39

<http://www.trai.gov.in/final%20consultation16th%20july.html>

<sup>49</sup> *supra* 32

**Cellular Mobile Telephone Service (CMTS)**

There are 25 private companies providing Cellular Services in 19 Telecom Circles and 4 Metro cities, covering 1500 towns across the country<sup>50</sup>. Presently, there are three private service operators in each area, and an incumbent state operator. Almost 80% of the cellular subscriber base belong to the pre-paid segment. The ratio of incoming to outgoing calls in cellular traffic continues to be 65:35. The industry is projected to reach 100 million subscribers by 2010<sup>51</sup>.

**Internet Service Provider (ISP) Policy**

Internet has become very easily accessible with cyber cafes /kiosks increasing their density, not only in the metro towns but also in semi-urban towns. There is no restriction on the number of internet companies and more than 200 companies are operational. Internet telephony has been allowed officially from 1 April 2002<sup>52</sup>. The growing demand of corporates for applications such as Electronic Commerce, internet leased lines, ISDN, VPN etc is driving the growth of the internet services market. However, the industry continues to face a number of bottlenecks in terms of regulatory treatment of ISPs, high bandwidth prices, low PC penetration, high cost of telephone access etc<sup>53</sup>.

**International Long Distance Services (ILD)**

The sector has been opened to competition from April 02. The ILD market in India is worth about Rs 54440 (716.3) m. The ratio of incoming and outgoing calls is about 4:1, due to the highly skewed monopolistic pricing so far by the State operator – VSNL. The ILD prices have fallen by at least 40%-60% leading to a decrease in the grey market traffic. The market is projected to be 7.5 billion minutes and worth £1.44 bn by 2010.<sup>54</sup>

**National Long Distance Services (NLD)**

In August 2000, the NLD service was finally opened to unrestricted competition. Due to the initial lack of clarity on critical issues like equal access, interconnectivity and last mile access, there were not many takers. With the opening up of the basic services and ILD, companies are now gearing

up to provide integrated service.<sup>55</sup> The NLD market thus saw significant competition in 2002-03, resulting in more choices and lower prices for consumers.

**Global Mobile Personal Communication by Satellite (GMPCS) Service**

Government of India introduced GMPCS Service in Aug 98 on certain terms and conditions such as FDI cap of 49%; location of Gateways in India /maintenance of Gateways with organisation designated by the Government; award of licenses on a "first-come-first serve basis"<sup>56</sup>.

**Very Small Aperture Terminal (VSAT) Service**

VSATs in India used to operate on the INSAT series of Satellites on the extended C-band but now the Government has allowed Ku-band and also a foreign satellite on the Ku-band front.<sup>57</sup> India has a total installed base of 17,292 VSATs on the shared hub front. TDMA dominates the scene with 86% market share whereas DAMA accounts for only 14% of the total VSAT sales<sup>58</sup>. VSATs have found a growing market in retail (banking and lottery) space and distance education.

**Public Mobile Radio Trunked Service (PMRTS)**

The PMRTS industry in India is still a small and fragmented sector. During 2002-03, the total PMRTS subscriber base was 50,000.<sup>59</sup> The Department of Telecommunications (DoT) guidelines for the migration of existing operators to digital technology and allowing PSTN and inter-site connectivity have not yet materialised. Lack of clarity in government policies, the prohibitively high license fee and exorbitant prices of radio trunking handsets are the main hurdles for the growth of PMRTS industry in India<sup>60</sup>. The other services available are Paging Services, Value added services, Voice Mail & Audiotex Service.

**The Telecom Equipment Industry**

<sup>55</sup> Chanda, R., "Liberalizing Professional Services under the GATS: The Indian Perspective", presented at FIEO workshop on Trade in Services, Bangalore, June 23, 2003.

<sup>56</sup> Mattoo, Aaditya, and Subramanian, Arvind, "Regulatory Autonomy and Multilateral Disciplines" in Journal of International Economic Law, vol. 1, pages 303-322, 1998.

<sup>57</sup> *Supra* 51

<sup>58</sup> Engineering Council of India <http://www.iete.info/ECI/ImplicationsGATS.htm>

<sup>59</sup> TIA India <http://www.tiaonline.org/policy/global/wto/india2.cfm>

<sup>60</sup> see

<http://www.asiatraderhub.com/india/telecom2.asp>

<sup>50</sup> Edited by AADITYA MATTOO and ROBERT M. STERN, India and the WTO, paper ed., (Oxford, 2003) at 105

<sup>51</sup> Asia Trade Hub, India Infrastructure Telecom <http://www.asiatraderhub.com/india/telecom.asp>

<sup>52</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>53</sup> Sawhney, A. and Rupa Chanda, "India's Opportunities and Constraints", Working Paper No. 102, ICRIER, New Delhi, June 2003.

<sup>54</sup> *Ibid*

The domestic industry is worth Rs 150,000 (£1974) million and has made little progress in comparison to the development of telecom services in the country.<sup>61</sup> The industry is faced with two major challenges: India is being steadily opened up to the global market, as trade restrictions are done away with, resulting in crashing of import duties across the board and easy movement of goods from overseas. It is forecasted that by 2005, imported telecom equipment will account for 75% of the expenditure on telecom equipment in India<sup>62</sup>. Secondly, to cut down on operations costs, US, European and East Asian multinationals are outsourcing manufacturing to cheaper destinations in Taiwan and China<sup>63</sup>.

#### **Television Broadcasting, Cable Television and Radio**

The market for broadcast equipment in India is big and growing at a rapid rate. TV households in India are expected to grow from 99 million in 2003 to 111 million in 2007<sup>64</sup>. According to a survey conducted by National Council of Applied Economic Research (NCAER), penetration of TV in rural areas is expected to grow almost four-fold from 48 TV sets per thousand population in 1988-89 to 185 TV sets per thousand population in 2006-07. In urban areas number of TV sets per thousand population are expected to grow from 304 in 1988-89 to 723 in 2007<sup>65</sup>.

There are more than 150 TV channels beaming in the sub-continent. Terrestrial Transmission is covering almost 90% of the sub-continent. Digital Terrestrial Transmission or DTT is functioning in the four metro cities of Delhi, Mumbai, Kolkata and Chennai. Big Broadcasters like Doordarshan, STAR TV, ZEE TV etc., are likely to start DTH shortly.<sup>66</sup>

#### **MFN Exemptions**

India has also sought MFN exemptions for measures including the application of different accounting rates covered by Telecommunication

Agreements entered into by the Government of India<sup>67</sup> with different neighbouring countries such as Pakistan, Bangladesh, Nepal and Bhutan. India's explanation for this exemption is that it has entered into various bilateral agreements with governments of neighbouring countries<sup>68</sup>. Again, the exemption sought is for an indefinite duration. The indefinite duration for which India seeks both exemptions is potentially inconsistent with paragraph 6 of the Annex on MFN Exemptions, which limits such exemptions to 10 years with review at the end of 5 years<sup>69</sup>.

#### **Regulatory Authority**

India refused to accept that the regulatory body must be separate from and not accountable to any supplier of telecommunications services, presumably because Department of Telecommunications (DOT) continued to be the licensor, to enjoy some regulatory functions and to have the power to give (Telecommunications Regulatory Authority of India) TRAI directions under TRAI Act<sup>70</sup>.

At the same time, in the dispute between the Government and the TRAI over the attempt of the latter to establish its independence, the TRAI Act was amended in the year 2000<sup>71</sup>. Rather than strengthening the independence of the TRAI after the courts had interpreted the TRAI Act as limiting the powers of the regulator, the Government amended the TRAI act to establish the Telecom Disputes Settlement and Appellate Tribunal ("TDSAT"), which was vested with the TRAI's powers to adjudicate disputes between licensors, licensees, service providers and consumers<sup>72</sup>.

<sup>67</sup>GATS/EL/42/Suppl.1 dated April 11, 1997.

<sup>68</sup> Information Highways and Telecommunications in Asia, 2003  
<http://www.mindbranch.com/catalog/product.jsp?code=R170-0167>

<sup>69</sup>Laura B. Sherman, "Wildly Enthusiastic about the First Multilateral Agreement on Trade in Telecommunications Services", FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS LAW JOURNAL (Dec. 1998)

<http://static.highbeam.com/f/federalcommunicationlawjournal/december011998/wildlyenthusiasticaboutthefirstmultilateralagreeme/>

<sup>70</sup> Prof. Ram Jakhu, A Brief Analysis of the Indian Communication Convergence Bill (2000)  
<http://www.law.mcgill.ca/institutes/csri/paper-jakhu-analysis.php3>

<sup>71</sup> TRAI Act 2 of 2000 which came into force on January 24, 2000, see The Gazette of India  
[http://www.trai.gov.in/ord\\_00.html](http://www.trai.gov.in/ord_00.html)

<sup>72</sup> Section 14 of TRAI Act 2000 also see The Gazette of India

<sup>61</sup> Economic Editor Conference 2001, Ministry of Communications Department of Telecommunications, Govt. of India  
<http://pib.nic.in/archive/eec/eec2001/dot.html>

<sup>62</sup> Asia Trade Hub, Five year Plan prospective plan target  
<http://www.asiatradehub.com/india/telecom6.asp>

<sup>63</sup> *supra* 33  
<http://www.uktradeinvest.gov.uk/telecom/india/profile/overview.shtml>

<sup>64</sup> *supra* 62

<sup>65</sup> *supra* 62

<sup>66</sup> see

<http://www.indolink.com/Forum/India/messages/6823.html>

However, competition issues are not subject to adjudication by the TDSAT but rather by the Monopolies and Restrictive Trade Commission<sup>73</sup>.

After the amendment in 2000, TRAI's functions have been better defined and in certain instances, for example, with respect to powers relating to interconnection conditions, have increased<sup>74</sup>.

Analysis of recent work in India suggests that perhaps the biggest challenge will be to understand and foresee regulatory developments, much of which is incomprehensible to international audiences<sup>75</sup>. Amazingly, the Department of Telecommunications (DoT) which is the leading service provider in most of the country, is also the authority that grants licences<sup>76</sup>. Besides structural complexity, there exists a lack of confidence in

---

[http://www.traai.gov.in/ord\\_00.html](http://www.traai.gov.in/ord_00.html), states as follows:

“Establishment of Appellate Tribunal – The Central Government shall, by notification, establish an Appellate Tribunal to be known as the Telecom Disputes Settlement and Appellate Tribunal to (a) adjudicate any dispute –

- (i) between a licensor and a licensee
- (ii) between two or more service providers;
- (iii) between a service provider and a group of consumers

<sup>73</sup> Id. Section 14(a)(A) provides that “nothing in this clause shall apply in respect of matters relating to – (A) the monopolistic trade practice, restrictive trade practice and unfair trade practices which are subject to the jurisdiction of the Monopolies and Restrictive Trade Practices Commission”. The Monopolies and Restrictive Trade Practices Act, 1969 is in the process of being repealed. The Competition Act, 2002 has been passed by both the houses of Parliament but is awaiting notification by the Government of India. Under the Act, the powers of the Competition Commission would extend to all issues relating to competition

<sup>74</sup> TRAI Act, Section 11. See Rajat Kathuria, Harsha Vardhana Singh and Anita Soni, Telecommunications Policy Reform in India [http://66.102.9.104/search?q=cache:fS3c4wHucVsj:www1.worldbank.org/wbiop/trade/services\\_files/Singh.pdf+Rajat+Kathuria,+Harsha+Vardhana+Singh+and+Anita+Soni,+Telecommunications+Policy+Reform+in+India&hl=en&ie=UTF-8](http://66.102.9.104/search?q=cache:fS3c4wHucVsj:www1.worldbank.org/wbiop/trade/services_files/Singh.pdf+Rajat+Kathuria,+Harsha+Vardhana+Singh+and+Anita+Soni,+Telecommunications+Policy+Reform+in+India&hl=en&ie=UTF-8)

<sup>75</sup> APRO workshop on Indian Telecom, Feb 2003 <http://www.uniapro.org/apt450.htm>

<sup>76</sup> In accordance with the new telecom policy of the government, the regulatory and service provision arms of the DoT have been separated. Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited (BSNL) has been created as the largest service provider in India.

regulatory policy, and the recent confusion regarding limited mobility services being provided by fixed line incumbent has done nothing to strengthen confidence<sup>77</sup>.

### 5- Impediments and Targets

The EC indicated its "disappointment with India's offers on trade in services and hopes this country would improve it". According to Trade Commissioner Pascal Lamy, "India's offers fails to redress the current low level of Indian GATS commitments, and in some areas does not even reflect the current level of openness in the Indian market". The areas the EC would have liked to see more movement in included the telecom, distribution, or environmental services sectors.

Reviewing telecom trade agreements around the world, US Trade Representative Robert Zoellick has said that market access barriers existed in the form of “restrictions” in countries, including India<sup>78</sup>.

The report further charged that VSNL has no incentive to allow competitors (whose cable terminates at VSNL's landing station) to freely activate and market that capacity in India when it could keep prices (and market share) for its own services higher by limiting competitors' access to additional capacity.

The Indian government's monopoly on telecommunications services has failed to develop cheap, reliable, and state-of-the-art communications systems. New technological developments will soon render this monopoly system largely obsolete. India should waste no time in adopting a pro-competitive regulatory environment and making binding commitments to all principles set forth in the WTO Reference Paper<sup>79</sup>.

In order to reap the benefits associated with telecommunication liberalization, India should have to take some appropriate step such as: Commit fully to the reference paper of the Basic Telecommunications negotiations relating to interconnection, independence of regulator, dispute resolution machinery, transparency, full

---

<sup>77</sup> Mohsin Majid, Opportunities in the Indian Telecoms Market

[http://www.analysys.com/default\\_acl.asp?Mode=article&iLeftArticle=838&m=&n](http://www.analysys.com/default_acl.asp?Mode=article&iLeftArticle=838&m=&n)

<sup>78</sup> Washington, April 9, 2004, The Tribune <http://www.tribuneindia.com/2004/20040410/biz.htm#3>

<sup>79</sup> Reference Paper 24<sup>th</sup> April 1996 on Basic Telecommunications (available at [http://www.wto.org/english/tratop\\_e/serv\\_e/telecom\\_e/tel23\\_e.htm](http://www.wto.org/english/tratop_e/serv_e/telecom_e/tel23_e.htm))



commitment on EDI, removal of the restriction on equity of 51% on electronic/Voice Mail, elimination of the limit of 25% on cellular mobile telephone services and competitive safeguards and objective allocation of scarce resources<sup>80</sup>.

## 6- Liberalization of Telecommunications in India

Owing to its historical and economic circumstances, as well as its need for internal political accommodation, India has been slow to move toward privatization of its telecommunications sector. Lacking significant pressure from large business users or high-tech communities and fearful of the costs of competition (Government treasuries have profited greatly from the state-run telecommunications network.), fear that privatization and liberalization would result in unemployment<sup>81</sup>, India has made only gradual liberalizations that do not meet the recommendations of the WTO and international lending institutions.<sup>82</sup>

But subject to increasingly fierce international competition from callback services, Internet phone, low-earth-orbit satellites, and global operators, there is little doubt that new technology will progressively and irreversibly erode the market position of India's telecommunication monopolies and their high profit margins<sup>83</sup>. As a result, the financial value of these companies will deteriorate, making them less attractive to future investors<sup>84</sup>.

---

<sup>80</sup> Abrenica, Ma. Joy V. and Tony Warren, "Towards the Millennium Round East Asia and International Trade in Telecommunications Services."

[http://66.102.9.104/search?q=cache:V8GI-UYB5loJ:www1.worldbank.org/wbiop/trade/manila/telecoms\\_paper.pdf+Abrenica,+Ma.+Joy+V.+and+Tony+Warren,+%22Towards+the+Millennium+Round+East+Asia+and+International+Trade+in+Telecommunications+Services.%22&hl=en&ie=UTF-8](http://66.102.9.104/search?q=cache:V8GI-UYB5loJ:www1.worldbank.org/wbiop/trade/manila/telecoms_paper.pdf+Abrenica,+Ma.+Joy+V.+and+Tony+Warren,+%22Towards+the+Millennium+Round+East+Asia+and+International+Trade+in+Telecommunications+Services.%22&hl=en&ie=UTF-8)

also see

<http://www.asiatraderhub.com/india/telecom.asp>

<sup>81</sup> Chanda, R, "Should Indian Professionals Fear WTO?", Economic Times, Tuesday, July 29, 2003, p.7.

<sup>82</sup> *supra* note 56 pages 320- 324.

<sup>83</sup> Andreas Lowenfeld, International Economic Law (International Economic Law Series) Released: September, 2003 [http://www.law-edu.com/International\\_Economic\\_Law\\_International\\_Economic\\_Law\\_Series\\_0199264112.html](http://www.law-edu.com/International_Economic_Law_International_Economic_Law_Series_0199264112.html)

<sup>84</sup> Sherry M. Stephenson, Trade Unit 1999, Approaches to Services Liberalization by Developing Countries,

India has everything to gain from accelerating its telecommunications liberalization effort.

Significant headway has been made in liberalizing telecommunications. While the government-controlled corporation VSNL operates as the exclusive provider of international long-distance services and the monopoly Department of Telecommunications for the domestic long-distance services, private investors in joint ventures are allowed to provide intra-voice telephone services in various States and metro areas. Many value added services - including voice mail, radio paging and cellular mobile telephone - are now open to 49 per cent foreign equity participation<sup>85</sup>. A large portion of VSNL has been sold. However, much more could have been achieved.

India's forward-looking telecommunications policies set the stage for a new era of telecommunications development in India. The National Telecom Policy of 1994 (NTP 94) set the tone for government acknowledgement that an efficient telecommunications network is vital for the health of India's economy<sup>86</sup>. The New Telecommunications Policy of 1999 (NTP 99), announced April 1, 1999, builds upon the goals set forth in NTP 94. Although NTP 94 and NTP 99 are important first steps towards liberalization, more needs to be done if the goals set forth in each policy are to be realized.

## 7-Conclusion

Liberalization, deregulation, privatization and competition are all words that need to be seen in a positive light. They enable prices to tumble, innovation to accelerate, and development of

---

[http://www.sice.oas.org/tunit/studies/srv\\_lib/SRV4\\_e.asp](http://www.sice.oas.org/tunit/studies/srv_lib/SRV4_e.asp)

<sup>85</sup> Kathuria & Singh at 103. The authors states that "With the approval of the Foreign Investment Promotion Board, the maximum foreign equity permitted in the telecom services sector is as follows:

49 % Basic, cellular mobile, paging, V-SAT, mobile radio trunking, Internet; investment companies set up for investments in telecom services companies (investment by these companies in a telecom services company is treated as part of domestic equity and is not set off against the foreign equity cap) 51% Email, voice mail, online information and data retrieval, online information and/or data processing; enhanced/value-added facsimile services, including store and forward, store and retrieve."

<sup>86</sup> *Supra* note 45, [http://econ.worldbank.org/files/1716\\_wps2596.pdf](http://econ.worldbank.org/files/1716_wps2596.pdf)

information infrastructures to take off. Telecommunication is the backbone of India's future economy and the international competitiveness of India's economy increasingly depends on a telecommunications infrastructure that meets international standards.

The simple fact is that efficient and diversified telecommunications networks are now vital to the smooth functioning of an economy, and India's economy is no exception. India's information-based industries are expanding rapidly, and these industries are dependent on fast and reliable information transmission. Indian engineers, for example, transmit software code from Bangalore to Texas Instruments; they must be able to transmit large amounts of data securely and at a reasonable cost if they are to remain competitive internationally<sup>87</sup>. With privatization, telecommunications services would likely drop in price, become more reliable, and become better able to meet the diverse needs of end-users.<sup>88</sup> India need to push aggressively for the liberalisation of both domestic and foreign services markets and promote the development of improved rules. Then if developed countries also rise to the challenge of eliminating the barriers they maintain to exports from developing countries, we may well witness a virtuous cycle of mutually beneficial liberalization<sup>89</sup>.

The telecommunications sector in India continues to be a disappointment and to fail to serve the people and the economy of India. A comparison with similar countries, notably with China, shows what can be done. The fixed network has attained a teledensity of around 6.9 per cent, after half a century of independence. The mobile networks have reached only 1 per cent, half of that being added in the last twenty-four months.

The existing commitment to the GATS by India have been very modest and have remained subject to a complicated and opaque licensing regime, with

repeated and unhelpful interventions by the incumbent operators. The adoption of the full range of commitments in telecommunications would be a trigger to reform and thus to expansion of the telecommunications sector in India.

### **Bibliography**

#### **Books**

1. *Aaditya Mattoo & Robert Stern eds, India and the WTO (Oxford, 2003)*
2. *Telecommunications in India, from Telecommunications in Western Asia and the Middle East, edited by Eli Noam. Oxford University Press, 1997, New York.*
3. *Dréze, Jean, and Amartya Sen. India : Development and Participation. 2nd ed. New York : Oxford University Press, 2002.*
4. *Silver, Beverly J. Forces of Labor : Workers' Movements and Globalization since 1870. Cambridge : Cambridge University Press, 2003.*
5. *Scrase, Timothy J.; Todd Joseph Miles Holden; and Scott Baum, eds. Globalization, Culture and Inequality in Asia. Melbourne : Trans Pacific Press, 2003.*
6. *Chanda, R., Globalization of Services: India's Opportunities and Constraints, Oxford University Press, New Delhi, 2002.*
7. *Saunders, Robert J., et. al. Telecommunications and Economic Development. John Hopkins University Press, Baltimore, 1994.*
8. *Jussawalla, Meheroo, editor. Global Telecommunication Policies: The Challenge of Change. Greenwood Press, Connecticut, 1993.*
9. *Trade in telecommunications : the WTO Agreement.*

<sup>87</sup> Ashok R. Menon

[http://www.commercialdiplomacy.org/ma\\_projects/ma\\_india1.htm](http://www.commercialdiplomacy.org/ma_projects/ma_india1.htm)

<sup>88</sup> Braga, Carlos Primo A., Liberalizing Telecommunications and the Role of the World Trade Organization. Public Policy for the Private Sector, Note No. 120, The World Bank, June 1997. <http://rru.worldbank.org/PublicPolicyJournal/Summary.aspx?id=120>

<sup>89</sup> Matsushita, Schoenbaum & Mavroidis, The World Trade Organization, Law, Practice & Policy, 254 (Oxford, May 2003) [http://www.law-educ.com/The\\_World\\_Trade\\_Organization\\_Law\\_Practice\\_and\\_Policy\\_International\\_Economic\\_Law\\_Series\\_0198764723.html](http://www.law-educ.com/The_World_Trade_Organization_Law_Practice_and_Policy_International_Economic_Law_Series_0198764723.html)

- Liberalisation and protectionism in the world trading system / ed. by P.Ruttley, I.MacVay and A. Masa'deh. London : Cameron May, 1999*
10. *GATS 2000 : progressive liberalization. A positive agenda for developing countries : issues for future trade negotiations. MASHAYEKHI, M. : New York [etc.] : United Nations, 2000,*
  11. *GATS and the Millennium Round of multilateral negotiations : selected issues from the perspective of developing countries (1999, International economic regulation / ed. by J. Kelsey. Aldershot : Ashgate, 2002*
  12. *GATT Uruguay Round, developing countries & trade in services. MUKHERJEE, N. : New Delhi, Vikas, 1995.*
  13. *Clarke, P. & Coronos, S., Competition Law and Policy: Cases and materials, Oxford University Press, Melbourne. 1999*
  14. *Fair Trade and Harmonization: Prerequisites for Free Trade?; Bhagwati, Jagdish and Hudec, Robert (1996) (Eds.): Cambridge: Mass., The MIT Press, 1996.*
  15. *Feketekuty, Geza. International Trade in Services: An Overview and Blueprint for Negotiations. Ballinger Publishing, Massachusetts, 1988.*
  16. *The Changing International Telecommunications Environment: India. Case Study prepared by Phillips Tarifica LTD for the International Telecommunications Union, February 1998.*
  17. *Telecommunication Services in the Asia Pacific Countries, Hufbauer and Wada (1997).*
  18. *Saunders, Robert J., et. al. Telecommunications and Economic Development. John Hopkins University Press, Baltimore, 1994.*
  19. *The commanding Heights: The Battle Between Government and the Marketplace that is Remaking the Modern World. Yergin, Daniel and Joseph Stanislaw. Simon & Schuster, New York, 1998.*
  20. *Major Trade Policy Impediments" in Development, Trade, and the WTO: A Handbook, B. Hoekman, A. Mattoo, and P. English, World Bank, Washington, DC, 2002*
  21. *Services Trade Liberalization and Facilitation, (eds.) Sherry Stephenson and Christopher Findlay, Asia-Pacific Press, Australian National University, Canberra, Australia, 2002,*
  22. *Hoekman, B., "Assessing the General Agreement on Trade in Services," in The Uruguay Round and the Developing Countries, Cambridge University Press, 1996.*
  23. *"Impact of the Uruguay Round on Asia: Trade in Services and Trade-Related Investment Measures," in The Global Trading System and Developing Asia, A. Panagariya, M.G. Quibria and N. Rao (eds.), London: Oxford University Press., 1997.*
  24. *Globalization under Threat: The Stability of Trade Policy and International Agreements; Drabek, Zdenek (Ed.): Aldershot : Edward Elgar, 2001.*

#### Articles

- 1) Qian, Ying, "Financial Services Liberalization and GATS – Analysis of the commitments Under the General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS) at the World Trade Organization (WTO)," September 1999.
- 2) Shaping future GATS rules for trade in services. Washington, D.C. : World Bank, 2001. by MATTOO, A. (Policy research working paper ; WPS2596) ([http://econ.worldbank.org/files/1716\\_wps2596.pdf](http://econ.worldbank.org/files/1716_wps2596.pdf))
- 3) Petrazzini, Ben (2000): Global Trends in Market Reform; Geneva: ITU, Strategy and Policy Unit; (2000).
- 4) A Review of Market Openness and Trade in Telecommunications; Paris: OECD (1999)
- 5) Consultation Document on the WTO Negotiations under the General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS) Government of India Ministry of Commerce & Industry Department of Commerce Trade Policy Division [http://commerce.nic.in/wto\\_counsel\\_paper.htm](http://commerce.nic.in/wto_counsel_paper.htm)
- 6) Mody, Bella, Liberalization of Telecommunications in India in the Mid-1990s, from Telecommunications in Western Asia and the Middle East, by Eli Noam. Oxford University Press, 1997, New York
- 7) Trade Issues [http://europa.eu.int/comm/trade/issues/newround/index\\_en.htm](http://europa.eu.int/comm/trade/issues/newround/index_en.htm)
- 8) ITU <http://www.itu.int/aboutitu/overview/history.html>
- 9) Mattoo, Aaditya, MFN and the GATS; Regulatory barriers and the principle of non-discrimination in world trade law

- [http://www1.worldbank.org/wbiexp/trade/papers\\_2000/BPmfn.pdf](http://www1.worldbank.org/wbiexp/trade/papers_2000/BPmfn.pdf)
- 10) Low, P. and Aaditya Mattoo, "Reform in Basic Telecommunications and the WTO Negotiations: the Asian Experience," World Bank Working Paper, 1998  
[http://www.wto.org/english/res\\_e/reser\\_e/ae9801\\_e.htm](http://www.wto.org/english/res_e/reser_e/ae9801_e.htm)
  - 11) Third World Network GATS negotiations should first reduce current imbalance by Bhagirath Lal Das\*  
<http://www.twinside.org.sg/title/current.htm>
  - 12) Drake, Willaim.,J. and Noam, Eli,M. (1997): Assessing the WTO Agreement on Basic Telecommunications; in Hufbauer and Wada (1997).
  - 13) Abrenica, Ma. Joy V. and Tony Warren, "Towards the Millennium Round East Asia and International Trade in Telecommunications Services."  
[http://66.102.9.104/search?q=cache:V8GI-UYB5loJ:www1.worldbank.org/wbiexp/trade/manila/telecoms\\_paper.pdf+Abrenica,+Ma.+Joy+V.+and+Tony+Warren,+%22Towards+the+Millennium+Round+East+Asia+and+International+Trade+in+Telecommunications+Services.%22&hl=en&ie=UTF-8](http://66.102.9.104/search?q=cache:V8GI-UYB5loJ:www1.worldbank.org/wbiexp/trade/manila/telecoms_paper.pdf+Abrenica,+Ma.+Joy+V.+and+Tony+Warren,+%22Towards+the+Millennium+Round+East+Asia+and+International+Trade+in+Telecommunications+Services.%22&hl=en&ie=UTF-8)
  - 14) Adlung, Rolf, Carzaniga, Antonia and Mattoo, Aaditya (1999), The Pattern of Restrictions in GATS Schedules; Geneva: WTO, 1999.
  - 15) Wellenius, Björn, "Telecommunications Reform -- How to Succeed," The World Bank: Public Policy for the Private Sector, Note 130, October 1997.
  - 16) Smith, Peter L. and Bjorn Wellenius, "Mitigating Regulatory Risk in Telecommunications," The World Bank: Public Policy for the Private Sector, , July 1999.
  - 17) Adlung, Rudolf, "Liberalizing Trade in Services: From Marrakech to Seattle"2001.  
[http://www.scielosp.org/scielo.php?script=sci\\_arttext&pid=S0042-96862001000400013&lng=en&nrm=iso&tlng=en](http://www.scielosp.org/scielo.php?script=sci_arttext&pid=S0042-96862001000400013&lng=en&nrm=iso&tlng=en)
  - 18) Braga, Carlos Primo A., Liberalizing Telecommunications and the Role of the World Trade Organization. Public Policy for the Private Sector, Note No120, The World Bank, June 1997.  
<http://rru.worldbank.org/PublicPolicyJournal/Summary.aspx?id=120>
  - 19) Sission, Peter, The New WTO Telecom Agreement.  
<http://www.telecomsmag.com/issues/199709/tcs/sission.html>, September 1997.
  - 20) Wallsten, Scott J., "Competition, Privatization, and Regulation in Telecommunications Markets in Developing Countries: An Econometric Analysis of Reforms in Africa and Latin America," May 1999.
  - 21) Tuthill, L., "The GATS and New Rules for Regulators," Telecommunications Policy, November 1997.
  - 22) Tuthill, L., "Users' Rights? The multilateral rules on access to telecommunications," Telecommunications Policy, vol. 20, 89-99, 1996.
  - 23) Tohamy, Sahar, "Case Study of Egypt's Service Liberalization, Service Barriers and Implementation of the GATS Agreement," 1999.
  - 24) Smith, Peter, What the Transformation of Telecom Markets Means for Regulation. Public Policy for the Private Sector, The World Bank, June 1997.
  - 25) Sission, Peter, The New WTO Telecom Agreement. <http://www.telecomsmag.com/issues/199709/tcs/sission.html>, September 1997
  - 26) Introduction :New landscape  
[http://www.communicationswhitepaper.gov.uk/by\\_chapter/ch1/index.htm](http://www.communicationswhitepaper.gov.uk/by_chapter/ch1/index.htm)
  - 27) The Proceduralization of Telecommunications Law: Adapting to Convergence, [Colin Scott, London School of Economics and Political Science.](http://www.colin-scott.com/)  
[http://elj.warwick.ac.uk/jilt/wip/97\\_3scot/scott.htm](http://elj.warwick.ac.uk/jilt/wip/97_3scot/scott.htm)
  - 28) Ofiel ( Working Document ) Strategy Statement: Achieving the best deal for telecoms consumers, January 2000.  
[http://www.ofcom.org.uk/static/archive/ofiel/publications/about\\_ofiel/strat100.htm](http://www.ofcom.org.uk/static/archive/ofiel/publications/about_ofiel/strat100.htm)
  - 29) Messerlin, Patrick A., "Regulatory Reforms in Services and Commercial Policy: The Case of Developing Countries," August 1999.
  - 30) Info, Nugget India and WTO  
<http://pib.nic.in/infonug/info0999/i0109991.html#1>
  - 31) Goswami, Omkar, and David Dollar. 2002. "Competitiveness of Indian Manufacturing: Results from a Firm Level Survey." Confederation of Indian Industries, New Delhi.
  - 32) TIA WTO agreement on basic Telecommunication Services

- [http://www.tiaonline.org/international/global/wto/wto\\_agreement.cfm](http://www.tiaonline.org/international/global/wto/wto_agreement.cfm)
- 33) Triumph For Multilateralism, or the Market? Eric Senunas November 14, 1997  
[http://www.bc.edu/bc\\_org/avp/law/st\\_org/iptf/articles/content/1997111401.html](http://www.bc.edu/bc_org/avp/law/st_org/iptf/articles/content/1997111401.html)
- 34) From Marrakesh to Singapore: The WTO and Developing Countries by Magda Shahin  
<http://www.twinside.org.sg/title/magda-cn.htm>
- 35) EC approach to Service March 2001 <http://europa.eu.int/comm/trade/services/seaserv.htm>
- 36) Data on Telecommunications Markets covered by the WTO Negotiations on Basic Telecommunications, 17 February 1997  
[http://www.wto.org/english/news\\_e/pres97\\_e/data3.htm](http://www.wto.org/english/news_e/pres97_e/data3.htm)
- 37) GATS Annex on Article II Exemptions, [http://www.wto.org/english/res\\_e/booksp\\_e/analytic\\_index\\_e/gats\\_01\\_e.htm#article2](http://www.wto.org/english/res_e/booksp_e/analytic_index_e/gats_01_e.htm#article2)  
[http://www.wto.org/english/res\\_e/booksp\\_e/analytic\\_index\\_e/gats\\_01\\_e.htm#article3](http://www.wto.org/english/res_e/booksp_e/analytic_index_e/gats_01_e.htm#article3)  
[http://www.wto.org/english/res\\_e/books\\_p\\_e/analytic\\_index\\_e/gats\\_02\\_e.htm#article6](http://www.wto.org/english/res_e/books_p_e/analytic_index_e/gats_02_e.htm#article6)  
[http://www.wto.org/english/res\\_e/booksp\\_e/analytic\\_index\\_e/gats\\_02\\_e.htm#article8](http://www.wto.org/english/res_e/booksp_e/analytic_index_e/gats_02_e.htm#article8)
- 38) Developing Countries in the New Round of GATS Negotiations: From a Defensive to a Pro-Active Role Aaditya Mattoo September 1999  
[http://www.tradeobservatory.org/library/uploadedfiles/Developing\\_Countries\\_in\\_the\\_New\\_Round\\_of\\_GATS.htm](http://www.tradeobservatory.org/library/uploadedfiles/Developing_Countries_in_the_New_Round_of_GATS.htm)
- 39) WTO Document 97-1391, India: Schedule of Specific Commitments, derestricted by the WTO April 11, 1997.  
[http://www.bc.edu/bc\\_org/avp/law/st\\_org/iptf/articles/content/1997111401.html](http://www.bc.edu/bc_org/avp/law/st_org/iptf/articles/content/1997111401.html)
- 40) WTO Document 97-1388, India: List of Article II (MFN) Exemptions, derestricted by the WTO April 11, 1997.  
[http://216.239.59.104/search?q=cache:q7c7lQiat1AJ:www.wto.org/english/tratop\\_e/serv\\_e/telecom\\_e/e142s1.wp5+WTO+Document+97-1388,+India:+List+of+Article+II+\(MFN\)+Exemptions,+derestricted+by+the+WTO+April+11,+1997.&hl=en&ie=UTF-8](http://216.239.59.104/search?q=cache:q7c7lQiat1AJ:www.wto.org/english/tratop_e/serv_e/telecom_e/e142s1.wp5+WTO+Document+97-1388,+India:+List+of+Article+II+(MFN)+Exemptions,+derestricted+by+the+WTO+April+11,+1997.&hl=en&ie=UTF-8)
- 41) Communication Market in India  
<HTTP://WWW.UKTRADEINVEST.GOV.UK/TELECOM/INDIA/PROFILE/OVERVIEW.SHTML>
- 42) International Economic Law (International Economic Law Series) Andreas Lowenfeld Released: September, 2003  
[http://www.law-edu.com/International\\_Economic\\_Law\\_International\\_Economic\\_Law\\_Series\\_0199264112.html](http://www.law-edu.com/International_Economic_Law_International_Economic_Law_Series_0199264112.html)
- 43) Footer, Mary E., The International Regulation of Trade in Services Following Completion of the Uruguay Round, 29 Int'l Law.  
<http://www.abanet.org/intlaw/publications/ti1292.html>
- 44) Information Highways and Telecommunications in Asia - Volume 1: Asia Telecommunications Market Overview June 2003 Published by Budde Comm  
<http://www.mindbranch.com/catalog/product.jsp?code=R170-0165>
- 45) Mushtaq Ahmad (2000). "Pakistan and the GATS: An Assessment of Policies and Future Prospects ."  
<http://www1.worldbank.org/wbiep/trade/services/Ahmad.pdf>
- 46) Stahl, Tycho H.E., Liberalizing International Trade in Services: The Case for Sidestepping the GATT, 19 Yale J. Int'l L. (1994)
- 47) Rajat Kathuria, Harsha Vardhana Singh and Anita Soni, Telecommunications Policy Reform in India  
[http://66.102.9.104/search?q=cache:fS3c4wHucVsJ:www1.worldbank.org/wbiep/trade/services\\_files/Singh.pdf+Rajat+Kathuria,+Harsha+Vardhana+Singh+and+Anita+Soni,+Telecommunications+Policy+Reform+in+India&hl=en&ie=UTF-8](http://66.102.9.104/search?q=cache:fS3c4wHucVsJ:www1.worldbank.org/wbiep/trade/services_files/Singh.pdf+Rajat+Kathuria,+Harsha+Vardhana+Singh+and+Anita+Soni,+Telecommunications+Policy+Reform+in+India&hl=en&ie=UTF-8)
- 48) Stern, Robert M., "Developing Country Interests in the Forthcoming WTO Negotiations," February 16, 2000. The Journal of East Asian Affairs  
<http://www.fordschool.umich.edu/rsie/workingpapers/papers451-475/r456.pdf>
- 49) Telecommunication Sector Negotiations at the WTO: Case studies of India, Sri Lanka and Malaysia Krishnan Venugopal October 2003  
[http://66.102.9.104/search?q=cache:ZTxyAf7YM0J:www.unescap.org/tid/mtg/ituwt/oesc\\_s51b.pdf+Lee,+Cassey,+Telecommunications+Reforms+in+Malaysia,+2001+available+at+http://www.cassey.com/fea2001-6.pdf&hl=en&ie=UTF-8](http://66.102.9.104/search?q=cache:ZTxyAf7YM0J:www.unescap.org/tid/mtg/ituwt/oesc_s51b.pdf+Lee,+Cassey,+Telecommunications+Reforms+in+Malaysia,+2001+available+at+http://www.cassey.com/fea2001-6.pdf&hl=en&ie=UTF-8)
- 50) Information Highways and Telecommunications in Asia 2003 - Volume 9: South East Asia  
<http://www.mindbranch.com/catalog/product.jsp?code=R170-0171>
- 51) UK Trade & Investment, Communication market in India  
<http://www.uktradeinvest.gov.uk/telecom/india/profile/overview.shtml>

- 52) [Rajesh Chadha \(2000\). "GATS and Developing Countries: A Case Study of India ." World Bank Capacity Building Project](http://www1.worldbank.org/wbiep/trade/WTO2000workshops/Chadha_11.pdf)  
[http://www1.worldbank.org/wbiep/trade/WTO2000workshops/Chadha\\_11.pdf](http://www1.worldbank.org/wbiep/trade/WTO2000workshops/Chadha_11.pdf)
- 53) Manjeet Kripalani and Pete Engardio with Steve Hamm in New York , Nov.2003 ,India Rising , Indo link  
<http://www.indolink.com/Forum/India/messages/6823.html>
- 54) Asia Trade Hub, India Infrastructure Telecom  
<http://www.asiatraderhub.com/india/telecom.asp>
- 55) Asia Trade Hub ,Five year Plan prospective plan target  
<http://www.asiatraderhub.com/india/telecom6.asp>
- 56) Engineering Council of India  
<http://www.iete.info/ECI/ImplicationsGATS.htm>
- 57) TIA India  
<http://www.tiaonline.org/policy/global/wto/india2.cfm>
- 58) Economic Editor Conference 2001, Ministry of Communications Department of Telecommunications ,Govt. of India  
<http://pib.nic.in/archive/eec/eec2001/dot.html>
- 59) Ben-David, Dan, "Equalizing Exchange: Trade Liberalization and Economic Convergence," Quarterly Journal of Economics, 108(3), 1993
- 60) A Brief Analysis of the Indian Communication Convergence Bill (2000)by Prof. Ram Jakhu  
<http://www.law.mcgill.ca/institutes/csri/paper-jakhu-analysis.php3>
- 61) Information Highways and Telecommunications in Asia, 2003  
<http://www.mindbranch.com/catalog/product.jsp?code=R170-0167>
- 62) Opportunities in the Indian Telecoms Market by Mohsin Majid  
[http://www.analysis.com/default\\_acl.asp?Mode=article&iLeftArticle=838&m=&n](http://www.analysis.com/default_acl.asp?Mode=article&iLeftArticle=838&m=&n)
- 63) Mattoo, Aaditya, "National Treatment in the GATS: Corner-Stone or Pandora's Box?" in Journal of World Trade, Vol. 31/1, Geneva: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1997.
- 64) Mattoo, Aaditya, and Subramanian, Arvind, "Regulatory Autonomy and Multilateral Disciplines", in Journal of International Economic Law, vol. 1, 1998.
- 65) Randeep Rathindran, Carsten Fink, and Aaditya Mattoo "An Assessment of Telecommunications Reform in Developing Countries." World Bank Working Paper (2002)  
[http://econ.worldbank.org/files/20745\\_wps2909.pdf](http://econ.worldbank.org/files/20745_wps2909.pdf)
- 66) Chanda, R., "General Agreement on Trade in Services: Implications for Social Policy Making", Economic and Political Weekly, Vol. XXXVIII, No. 16, April2003
- 67) Trade Unit 1999 ,Approaches to Services Liberalization by Developing Countries ,Sherry M. Stephenson  
[http://www.sice.oas.org/tunit/studies/srv\\_1ib/SRV4e.asp](http://www.sice.oas.org/tunit/studies/srv_1ib/SRV4e.asp)
- 68) By Ashok R. Menon M.A. Commercial Diplomacy  
[http://www.commercialdiplomacy.org/ma\\_projects/ma\\_india1.htm](http://www.commercialdiplomacy.org/ma_projects/ma_india1.htm)
- 69) Matsushita, Schoenbaum & Mavroidis, The World Trade Organization, Law, Practice & Policy, 254 (Oxford, May 2003) [http://www.law-edu.com/The\\_World\\_Trade\\_Organization\\_Law\\_Practice\\_and\\_Policy\\_International\\_Economic\\_Law\\_Series\\_0198764723.html](http://www.law-edu.com/The_World_Trade_Organization_Law_Practice_and_Policy_International_Economic_Law_Series_0198764723.html)
- 70) Chanda, R., "Movement of Natural Persons and the GATS", World Economy, Vol. 24, No. 5, May 2001, (Oxford Blackwell Publishers), pp. 631-654.
- 71) Armstrong, Mark, "Competition in Telecommunications," Oxford Review of Economic Policy, Vol. 13, No. 1, Spring 1997, 1997.
- 72) Treasury Address and introduction by Lord Carey, former Archbishop of Canterbury ,16 February 2004, MAKING GLOBALISATION WORK FOR ALL CONFERENCE [http://www.hm-treasury.gov.uk/documents/international\\_issues/global\\_new\\_deal/int\\_gnd\\_globcarey.cfm](http://www.hm-treasury.gov.uk/documents/international_issues/global_new_deal/int_gnd_globcarey.cfm)
- 73) Rohlfs, Jeffery H., Regulating Telecommunications—Lessons from U.S. Price Cap Experience. Public Policy for the Private Sector, The World Bank, August 1996.
- 74) Clear North-South divide on services negotiations by Chakravarthi Raghavan  
<http://www.twinside.org.sg/title/serve-cn.htm>
- 75) Revolution Of Information & Communication In Asia: 'The Policy Of Communication In Asia' Dr John Chen, Minister of State For Communications – Speech Singapore, 17 September 1997  
[http://www.ida.gov.sg/idaweb/media/info\\_page.jsp?infopagecategory=tasarchivespeeches.speeches:media&versionid=4&infoageid=11085](http://www.ida.gov.sg/idaweb/media/info_page.jsp?infopagecategory=tasarchivespeeches.speeches:media&versionid=4&infoageid=11085)

- 76) Infrastructure Under The NDA - I A Reality Check by Abhijit Mukhopadhyay Shantanu De Roy March 21, 2004 [http://pd.cpim.org/2004/0321/03212004\\_infrastructure-nda.htm](http://pd.cpim.org/2004/0321/03212004_infrastructure-nda.htm)
- 77) Bronckers, Marco, C.E.J. and Pierre Larouche (1997): Telecommunication services and the World Trade Organization; Journal of World Trade, Vol.31, (1997), pp.5-48.
- 78) Chanda, R., "WTO Negotiations on Trade in Services: The Indian Perspective", Monthly Economic Digest, Vol. XXXII No: 6, Maharashtra Economic Development Council April 2003
- 79) Edwards, Sebastian, "Openness, Trade Liberalization, and Growth in Developing Countries," Journal of Economic Literature, XXXI (3), September 1993
- 80) Laura B. Sherman, "Wildly Enthusiastic about the First Multilateral Agreement on Trade in Telecommunications Services", FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS LAW JOURNAL 61 (Dec. 1998) <http://static.highbeam.com/f/federalcommunicationslawjournal/december011998/wildlyenthusiasticaboutthefirstmultilateralagreement/>
- 81) Deepak Pareek, Telecom Sector in India: Vision 2020 .available at <http://www.consultingbase.com/classified/clitem.cfm?adsid=321>
- Journals/ News**
- i. Apprehension over decision to open up key services sector, G. Srinivasan Business Line June 7 2003 <http://www.blonnet.com/2003/06/07/03hdline.htm>
  - ii. Silconeer July 2003 Vol IV issue 7 [http://www.siliconeer.com/past\\_issues/2003/july2003.html](http://www.siliconeer.com/past_issues/2003/july2003.html)
  - iii. Department of Telecommunications, India, 2002 <http://www.dotindia.com/plans/planindex.htm>
  - iv. Discusses India's role in the ministerial rounds of WTO. by VADUEVA, P.K [Economic Times., 15.12.2002 Newspapers](http://www.economic-times.com/15.12.2002>Newspapers)
  - v. Discusses the issues to be taken up at the next ministerial conference of WTO. By NAYYAR, Dhiraj [Economic Times., 15.11.2002 Newspapers](http://www.economic-times.com/15.11.2002/Newspapers)
  - vi. "Implementing the WTO Singapore Declaration in 1997 and beyond" Press Release ,12 May 1997 [http://www.wto.org/english/news\\_e/pres97\\_e/ap ec2.htm](http://www.wto.org/english/news_e/pres97_e/ap ec2.htm)
  - vii. India shining ,Monday 20<sup>th</sup> October 2003, <http://www.deccanherald.com/deccanherald/oct20/eb9.asp>
  - viii. Vyapar Asia ,INDIA TELECO <http://www.vyaparasia.com/india/telecom.asp>
  - ix. Highlights the economic growth of China with its entry into WTO and its impact on Indian economy By MISHRA, Bulbul Roy .[Pioneer., 7.2.2002 Newspapers](http://www.pioneer.com/7.2.2002/Newspapers)
  - x. Highlights how the developed countries accommodate the concerns of third world with regard to the recent developments that took place at multilateral trade negotiations at Doha. By RAY, Alok :[Telegraph., 26.9.2002 Newspapers](http://www.telegraph.com/26.9.2002/Newspapers)
  - xi. Focuses on the forthcoming 5th Ministerial conference of WTO to be held at Cancun, Mexico by MEHTA, Pradeep [Financial Express., 23.9.2002 Newspapers](http://www.financial-express.com/23.9.2002/Newspapers)
  - xii. Rich-poor battle ahead at WTO by SETHURAMAN, S National Herald,, 28.7.2002 Newspapers
  - xiii. Focuses on the issue of labour standards in the trade agenda. By DASGUPTA, Amit [Times of India., 5.7.2002 Newspapers](http://www.times-of-india.com/5.7.2002/Newspapers)
  - xiv. Overviews the outcome of the meeting of WTO

- to discuss the trade policy of India. By RAVI KANTH, D, [Deccan Herald,, 1.7.2002 Newspapers](#)
- xv. Urges for quick reforms in India in view of China's entry into WTO and US's tilts towards protectionism. By JHA, Raghendra [Economic Times,, 24.6.2002 Newspapers](#)
- xvi. "Should Indian Professionals Fear WTO?" by Chanda, R Economic Times, Debate section, Tuesday, July 29, 2003, p.7
- xvii. Overviews the outcome of Ministerial Conference of WTO at Doha and deals with issues for the next WTO round. SALLY, Razeen [Financial Express,, 23.2.2002 Newspapers](#)
- xviii. Washington ,April 9,2004 ,TheTribune [http://www.tribuneindia.com/2004/20040410/biz.htm#3](#)
- xix. The Gazette of India [http://www.trai.gov.in/ord\\_00.html](#)
- xx. India Telecom News New Delhi October 10, 2003 [http://www.indiatelecomnews.com/newdetails.asp?newsid=307](#)
- xxi. WTO Trade Policy Reviews Trade Policy Review: Mexico PRESS RELEASEPRESS/TPR B/19016 April 2002 [http://www.sice.oas.org/ctyindex/wto/mex190\\_e.asp](#)
- xxii. The WTO Negotiations on Basic Telecommunications , Press release 6 March 1997 [http://www.wto.org/english/news\\_e/pres97\\_e/suimary.htm](#)
- xxiii. TRADE POLICY REVIEWS: FIRST PRESS RELEASE, SECRETARIAT AND GOVERNMENT SUMMARIES PRESS RELEASEPRESS/TPR B/19521 June 2002 [http://www.wto.org/english/tratop\\_e/tp\\_r\\_e/tp196\\_e.htm](#)
- xxiv. Telecom- The emerging revolution in India by Sunil Naliyath ,The Hindu Monday, May 17, 2004 [http://www.hindu.com/2004/05/17/stories/2004051702280500.htm](#)
- xxv. investindiatelecom NTP '99 - Objectives and Achievements [http://www.investindiatelecom.com/Telecom%20Policy/Objectives.htm](#)
- xxvi. APRO workshop on Indian Telecon , Press Release Feb 2003 [http://www.uniapro.org/apt450.htm](#)
- xxvii. Figures at All-India/ indiastat.Com [http://www.indiastat.com/india/ShowData.asp?scid=19283&ptid=274&level=3](#)
- xxviii. Comments on India's position in the WTO. by BASU, Kaushik [Business Standard,, 6.3.2002 Newspapers](#)

#### **Reports & Papers**

1. Economist intelligence Unit, Country Report: India. London, 1997.
2. "China's Accession to the WTO: The Services Dimension." By Mattoo, Aaditya, Paper presented to conference on China's Accession to WTO, Policy Reform and Poverty Reduction, Beijing, June 28–29, 2002.
3. Communications Regulation in the UK — A paper by the Director General of Telecommunications, July 2000.



4. India & the WTO Vol 1- No.6 June 1999  
<http://commin.nic.in/doc/wtojun.htm>
5. The world bank report , 5 dec 2001 - Globalization, Growth and Poverty <http://econ.worldbank.org/prr/subpage.php?sp=2477>
6. International Telecommunication Union, World Telecommunication Development Report, 1996-97
7. National Trade Data Bank, India—Incentives for Telecom Sector. Market Research Reports, February, 1998.
8. UNCTAD, World Development Report 1997
9. U.S. International Trade Commission, Recent Trends in U.S. Services Trade. 1998 Annual Report, , May 1998.
10. U.S. Department of State, Background Notes: India. Bureau of South Asian Affairs, November 1997.
11. WTO Document 97-1391, India: Schedule of Specific Commitments, derestricted by the WTO April 11, 1997.
12. WTO General Agreement on Trade in Services an INTUG Position Paper INTUG 2001/0June 2001 [http://www.intug.net/views/wto\\_gats.html](http://www.intug.net/views/wto_gats.html)
13. GATS Campaign <http://www.wdm.org.uk/campaign/gats109leaks.htm>
14. WDM's campaign on the General Agreement on Trade in Services <http://www.wdm.org.uk/campaign/GATS.htm#GATSnegs>
15. TRAI [http://www.tcs.com/0\\_c ase\\_studies/Industry\\_practices/telecom\\_TRAI\\_casestudy.htm](http://www.tcs.com/0_c ase_studies/Industry_practices/telecom_TRAI_casestudy.htm)
16. Movement of Natural Persons and Trade in Services: Trade in Services: Opportunities and Constraints Working Paper, by R Chanda Indian Council for Research on International Economic Relations, New Delhi, 1999.
17. National Trade Data Bank, India—Incentives for Telecom Sector. Market Research Reports, Document ID 1140, February, 1998.
18. Economist Intelligence Unit, Country Profile: India. London, 1997-1998.
19. “Movement of Natural Persons and Trade in Services: Liberalizing Temporary Movement of Labour under the GATS”, Chanda, R.. presented at public policy workshop, Indian Institute of Management, Bangalore, October 1999.
20. India and GATS 2000: Negotiating Strategies and Domestic Reforms, Indian Council for Research on International Economic Relations, New Delhi, September 2001.
21. "Regulating Telecommunications in Developing Countries," Galal, Ahmed and Bharat Nauriyal, WB Policy Research Working Paper 1520, October 1995.
22. “Is There a Better Way? Alternative Approaches to Liberalization Under the GATS,” Low, Patrick and Aaditya Mattoo, presented at a Brookings Institution Conference in June 1999.
23. GATS and its Implications for Developing Countries: Key Issues and Concerns, Chanda, R., prepared for the UN Division on Social Policy and Development, Department of Economics and Social Affairs, New York, January 2002.
24. “Liberalizing Cross Border Mobility of Professionals” Chanda, R., presented at Wilton Park conference on Migration and Foreign Policy, Executive Agency of the UK’s Foreign and Commonwealth Office, West Sussex, England, October 2-5, 2000.
25. Working paper, Sawhney, A. and Rupa Chanda, " India's Opportunities and

- Constraints", Working Paper No. 102, ICRIER, New Delhi, June 2003.
26. "India and GATS 2000: Negotiating Strategies and Domestic Reforms" Chanda, R., presented at seminar on India and GATS 2000, India Habitat Centre, New Delhi, September 2001.
  27. "Liberalizing Professional Services under the GATS: The Indian Perspective", Chanda, R., presented at FIEO workshop on Trade in Services, Bangalore, June 23, 2003.
  28. "Cross Border Supply and Movement of Natural Persons: Complementary Approach to Liberalization" Chanda, R., presented at Expert Meeting on Movement of Natural Persons, organized by UNCTAD, Geneva, July 29-31, 2003.
  29. "Impediments to Foreign direct Investment in East Asia," Yue, Chia Siow and Nick Freeman, Report for World Bank.
  30. "Regional Agreements on Services and Multilateral Disciplines: Interpreting and Applying GATS Article V," Stephenson, Sherry M., paper prepared for the conference Global Services Trade and the Americas in Costa Rica, July 1999.
  31. "East Asia and Options for WTO 2000 Negotiations: Investment," Bora, Bijit and Shujiro Urata, paper presented at the World Bank -- PECC Trade Policy Forum conference on East Asia and Options for WTO 2000 Negotiations, Manila, July 1999.  
<http://64.233.161.104/search?q=cache:23gEa7trFNlJ:www1.worldbank.org/wbiep/trade/manila/PECC-WB.pdf+Bora,+Bijit+and+Shujiro+Urata,+%22East+Asia+and+Options+for+WTO+2000+Negotiations:+Investment,%22+paper+presented+at+the+World+Bank+--+PECC+Trade+Policy+Forum+conference+on+East+Asia+and+Options+for+WTO+2000+Negotiations,+Manila,+July+1999.&hl=en&ie=UTF-8>
  32. "Playing Catch-up in a Global Environment: Future Liberalization of Telecommunications under the WTO and Associated Regulatory Reform," Bradford, Meriel V. M., draft paper prepared for the OAS Conference on Global Services Trade and the Americas in Costa Rica, July 1999.
  33. "The WTO Agreement and Telecommunication Policy Reforms," Cowhey, Peter and Mikhail M. Klimenko, A Draft Report, The World Bank, March 1999.
  34. "Telecommunications in the Region: Comparative Case Studies," Petrazzini, B.A., and Lovelock, P., paper presented at the International Institute for Communication Telecommunications Forum, Sydney, Australia, 22-23 April 1996.
  35. "Approaches to Liberalizing Services," Stephenson, Sherry M., WB Policy Research Working Paper 2107, May 1999.
  36. Warren, Tony and Christopher Findlay, "How Significant are the Barriers? Measuring Impediments to Trade in Services," paper presented at the conference Services 2000: New Directions in Services Trade Liberalization at the University Club in Washington, D.C., June 1999.
  37. Financial services and the WTO : MATTOO, A. : liberalization in the developing and transition economies. Geneva : WTO, 1998. (Staff working paper; TISD9803)
  38. Reference Paper 24<sup>th</sup> April 1996 on Basic Telecommunications (available at [http://www.wto.org/english/tratop\\_e/serv\\_e/telecom\\_e/tel23\\_e.htm](http://www.wto.org/english/tratop_e/serv_e/telecom_e/tel23_e.htm))
  39. World Economic Forum. 2002/03 and previous years. Global Competitiveness Report. Oxford University Press: USA.
  40. Telecom Regulatory authority of India Consultation Paper July 16, 2003 <http://www.trai.gov.in/final%20consultation16th%20july.html>
  41. WTO Document 97-1391, India: Schedule of Specific Commitments, derestricted by the WTO April 11, 1997.  
[http://www.bc.edu/bc\\_org/avp/law/st\\_org/iptf/articles/content/1997111401.html](http://www.bc.edu/bc_org/avp/law/st_org/iptf/articles/content/1997111401.html)
  42. WTO Document 97-1388, India: List of Article II (MFN) Exemptions, derestricted by the WTO April 11, 1997.  
[http://216.239.59.104/search?q=cache:q7c7lQiat1AJ:www.wto.org/english/tratop\\_e/serv\\_e/telecom\\_e/el42s1.wp5+WTO+Document+97-1388,+India:+List+of+Article+II+\(MFN\)+Exemptions,+derestricted+by+the+WTO+April+11,+1997.&hl=en&ie=UTF-8](http://216.239.59.104/search?q=cache:q7c7lQiat1AJ:www.wto.org/english/tratop_e/serv_e/telecom_e/el42s1.wp5+WTO+Document+97-1388,+India:+List+of+Article+II+(MFN)+Exemptions,+derestricted+by+the+WTO+April+11,+1997.&hl=en&ie=UTF-8)
  43. WTO ANALYTICAL INDEX: GENERAL AGREEMENT ON TRADE IN SERVICES  
[http://www.wto.org/english/res\\_e/booksp\\_e/analytic\\_index\\_e/gats\\_e.htm](http://www.wto.org/english/res_e/booksp_e/analytic_index_e/gats_e.htm)
  44. BACKGROUND NOTE: BASIC TELECOMMUNICATIONS  
6 March 1997  
[http://www.wto.org/english/news\\_e/pres97\\_e/bt-summ3.htm](http://www.wto.org/english/news_e/pres97_e/bt-summ3.htm)

45. A Review of Market Openness and Trade in Telecommunications; Paris: OECD, DSTI, Working Party on Telecommunication and Information Services Policies, 1999.
46. ITU/ESCAP/WTO Regional Seminar on Telecommunications and Trade Issues 28-30 October 2003, Bangkok, Thailand

Copyright © 2008 by the International Business Information Management Association (IBIMA). All rights reserved. Authors retain copyright for their manuscripts and provide this journal with a publication permission agreement as a part of IBIMA copyright agreement. IBIMA may not necessarily agree with the content of the manuscript. The content and proofreading of this manuscript as well as any errors are the sole responsibility of its author(s). No part or all of this work should be copied or reproduced in digital, hard, or any other format for commercial use without written permission. To purchase reprints of this article please e-mail: [admin@ibima.org](mailto:admin@ibima.org).